Appendix E. Scoping Comments Disposition Table

This appendix summarizes the comments received from the public during the scoping process. These comments are grouped based on the following categories:

- Track Configuration Options
- Vertical Alignment Options
- Grade Separations
- Station Location Options
- Other Peninsula Routes
- Non-Peninsula Routes
- Alternative Technologies

The disposition of the comments is noted in the following table. Most of the comments related to the vertical alignment options, grade separations and station location options will be addressed in the Alternative Analysis process. The comments that will not be addressed by the Alternatives Analysis process are either conceptual design issues that will be addressed later as the EIR/EIS and preliminary engineering process moves forward, or issues previously determined in the Statewide Program EIR/EIS and the Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS.





	Scoping Comments	Disposition
Track Configuration	Minimum of four tracks for the HST	Included in Alternatives Analysis
Options	Use only existing two tracks (Caltrain and HST operate at 79mph)	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Reduce the number of required tracks in the rights-of-way to less than four tracks	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Entirely separate the HST tracks at Caltrain local stops in order to provide separation between the station platform and 150 MPH trains	Conceptual Design Issue (Max speed in Caltrain Corridor to be 125 mph)
	Use existing tracks with fewer stops at higher speed	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Move HST tracks onto Central Expressway to avoid impacts to the downtown station	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Use fewer sets of tracks to eliminate grade separations at every crossing	 Included in Alternatives Analysis. Authority has a policy of no at-grade crossings on HST system.
	Consider use of steeper slope on the tracks instead of a 1% limitation.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 Provide 3- track (instead of 4 track for HST Caltrain and UPRR) to lessen or avoid physical impacts in the Gardner and North Willow Glen neighborhoods. 	Study by San Jose to Merced section
	Keep two-track configuration in City of Millbrae	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Make track bed compatible with freight trains.	Conceptual Design Issue
	 During construction, build HST rail on the outside with Caltrain tracks in the center. When complete, move HST to the center tracks and Caltrain to the outside 	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Run HST on the outside two tracks of the four track corridor (fast-slow-slow-fast configuration)	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Four-track system will require 6 tracks at station. No room to accommodate	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 San Jose Station: relocate yard tracks #6 through #9 at Caltrain's CEMOF to the north of the facility, allowing HST to avoid the double reverse curve around the CEMOF building 	Conceptual Design Issue
Vertical Alignment Options	General Comments	
(general, and then south to	Partially underground or overhead both road and/or railroad	Included in Alternatives Analysis
north)	At-Grade Alignment	
	No at-grade alternatives.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 An at-grade option with grade separated crossings and HST service running at Caltrain Baby Bullet speeds from SJ to SF 	This has been determined not to meet the purpose and need of the HST system.
	At grade tracks with underpasses at cross streets for auto and pedestrian traffic.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	At-grade tracks in Sunnyvale, with underpass at Mary Avenue.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	At-grade, depressed open trench and tunnel through the corridor in Mountain View	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 Keep tracks at existing elevations and tunnel/depress intersections of Alma, Churchill, Meadow and Charleston in Palo Alto. 	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Mixed Vertical Alignment	
	Elevated and below-grade rail to avoid eminent domain.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Elevate or lower the tracks in the downtown San Jose areas	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Aerial Alignment	
	Support track beds and platforms on a viaduct structure.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Elevate tracks with piers for support.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Elevate line vertically sufficiently high to keep these heavily congested areas serene	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	IIS Department	





Scoping Comments	Disposition
Elevate tracks with development potential underneath.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
Consider elevated structures with sheer vertical walls or pilings where cars can be parked below the track.	Conceptual Design Issue
Elevate HST tracks above existing Caltrain tracks	Included in Alternatives Analysis
No elevated tracks in residential areas.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
No elevated tracks for all of HST	Included in Alternatives Analysis
No elevated tracks on peninsula.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
No elevated tracks the length of the peninsula or the length of Palo Alto.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
Below-Grade Alignment	
Underground all trains (freight included)	Included in Alternatives Analysis
Underground Caltrain and HST throughout peninsula.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
Underground tracks in the El Camino Real to 101 corridor.	Determined in Statewide Document
Put the HST tracks with hot rail (not overhead electric wire) under existing Caltrain tracks	Determined in Statewide Document (Technology selected for entire system)
Underground through entire peninsula	 Studied in Statewide document. Alternatives Analysis will will study underground opt throughout the section
Underground HST through Silicon Valley.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
Underground from Woodside Road past Sunnyvale until the line enters industrial areas.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
 Descend into a trench adjacent to the UPRR ROW near Curtner Ave and go underground before Tamien Station, travel under Guadalupe River and Los Gatos Creek, arriving underground at Diridon Station. 	Possibly under evaluation by San Jose to Merced Team
Below grade profile between Julian Street and Tamien Station area (SJ)	Included in Alternatives Analysis
No new aerial structures through Sunnyvale; lower the rail system to achieve grade separation	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through Mountain View	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through Palo Alto	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground tracks through College Park	Included in Alternative Analysis
 Underground tracks in Alma Street ROW, and maintain Caltrain service in JPB ROW. 	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through downtowns, small cities such as Menlo Park	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through Menlo Park	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through Atherton	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through Redwood City	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground tracks through San Carlos.	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground through City of Belmont	Included in Alternative Analysis
Depress rail in the downtown area of City of San Mateo	Included in Alternative Analysis
Underground/Tunnel through Burlingame.	Included in Alternative Analysis
 Underground track in Burlingame where residential or shopping districts (Broadway and Burlingame Ave) are located near tracks. 	Included in Alternative Analysis
 Underground tracks from north of the 23rd street tunnel portal through the northern terminal (SF) 	Included in Alternative Analysis





	Scoping Comments	Disposition
	Create subways	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Cut and cover tracks.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Underground through a covered tunnel	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Underground tracks 50 feet below ground.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Deep tunneling of all tracks.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Tunnel through entire peninsula.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Tunnel through residential areas.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench through residential areas.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Tunnel or trench through Menlo Park and Atherton.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Tunnel through Menlo Park/Atherton corridor.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Tunnel through Palo Alto, Menlo Park and Atherton.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Tunnel under Palo Alto and Menlo Park	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench from Palo Alto through Atherton.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	 Tunnel or trench through residential portions of track, including Menlo Park, Atherton, and Palo Alto. 	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench and cover, or tunnel through residential areas including Atherton, Menlo Park, Palo Alto.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench between Palo Alto (or Mountain View) and Redwood City.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench to provide non-elevated street overpasses through Palo Alto and Redwood City.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	 Use two tier tunnel (HST & Baby Bullet lower, local and freight upper), where the upper tier may be open to the air, in a Hat trench 	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trenched roadbed 20 feet below grade.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench and cover with surface streets on top.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench tracks 15 feet deep.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Trench HST tracks between Caltrain tracks.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	No trenched rail	Included in Alternative Analysis
Grade Separations Included	General Comments	
in Alternatives Analysis	Grade separation at all street crossings.	Design Criteria Requirement for HST
	Eliminate grade crossings.	Design Criteria Requirement for HST
	Grade separated crossovers for freight trains at necessary locations.	Conceptual Design Issue
	Include appropriate underpasses at cross streets.	Conceptual Design Issue
	Site-Specific Comments	
	Grade separate all existing grade crossings in Sunnyvale	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Underpass at Mary Ave in Sunnyvale	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Eliminate grade crossing at Rengstroff Ave. Degrade Rengstroff Average begans to the tree lease.	Included in Alternative Analysis Included in Alternative Analysis
	Depress Rengstorff Avenue beneath the tracks Depress all roll facilities beneath Departure (including open trouch and tuppe)	Included in Alternative Analysis Included in Alternative Analysis
	 Depress all rail facilities beneath Rengstorff Avenue (including open trench and tunnel) Depress the HST tracks beneath Rengstorff Avenue (including open trench and tunnel) 	Included in Alternative AnalysisIncluded in Alternative Analysis
	• Depress the fish tracks beheath Kengstorn Avenue (including open trench and tuliner)	• Included III Alternative Arialysis





	Scoping Comments	Disposition
	Completely or partially elevate rail facilities above Rengstorff Avenue	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Depress Castro Street beneath the tracks.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Close or reroute Castro Street/ Moffett Boulevard	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Depress the HST tacks beneath Castro Street/ Moffett Boulevards (including open trench and tunnel)	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Depress all rail facilities beneath Castro Street/ Moffett Boulevard (including open trench and tunnel	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Completely or partially elevate rail facilities above Castro Street/ Moffett Boulevard	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Grade separate at Central Expressway near Whisman Road and Expressway near Sterlin Road in Mountain View	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Grade separate at Menlo Park, Palo Alto Ave., Alma, and Stanford.	Included in Alternative Analysis
	 Grade separated pedestrian/bicycles crossings at the following intersections in Palo Alto; Homer, Embarcadero, Churchill, California, East Meadow, and Charleston. 	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Create underpasses at Churchill and at Charleston	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Create an overpass at El Camino/Alma	Included in Alternative Analysis
	Close the West Meadow crossing	Included in Alternative Analysis
	• San Mateo Rail Corridor Transit Oriented Development Plan proposed grade separations at 28 th and 31 st which need to be implemented prior to HST to ensure that the Bay Meadows Specific Plan development is not impeded	Included in Alternative Analysis
	No grade crossing in Burlingame	Included in Alternative Analysis
	 Grade separation at 16th Street and Owen street in Mission Bay area (SF) 	Included in Alternative Analysis
Station Location Options	General Comments	
	No station stops between SF and SJ.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Only one stop in the peninsula.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Specific Station Location Comments	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	Santa Clara HST Station	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Sunnyvale HST Station	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Mountain View HST Station	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 HST Station in Mountain View between Stevens Creek and Castro Street, the entire block south of PCJPB could be acquired. 	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Have a Castro stop so that the tracks do not connect to Moffett Blvd	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Palo Alto Station – propose and oppose	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	California Avenue HST Station in Palo Alto	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Underground HST station in Palo Alto	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Atherton HST Station Parkers of City UST Station and appropriate to the control of the con	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS Included in Alternative Amelysis
	Redwood City HST Station – propose and oppose Link Padwood City to Sagueia or El Camina Station	Included in Alternative Analysis Concentral Design Jacobs
	 Link Redwood City to Sequoia or El Camino Station HST Station at SFO 	Conceptual Design Issue Millbrae Station in Stational Program FLD/FLS
		Millbrae Station in Statewide Program EIR/EIS Millbrae Station in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	 Millbrae HST Station – propose and oppose HST Station at Transbay Terminal. 	Millbrae Station in Statewide Program EIR/EIS Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 HST Terminus between 3rd and 4th Street on Market Street in San Francisco. 	Included in Alternatives Analysis Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Other Comments – not relevant to SJ to SF HST Project	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	other comments – not relevant to 30 to 31 H31 Froject	





	Scoping Comments	Disposition
	No stations in Merced	Out of Study Area
	Los Banos Station	Out of Study Area
	Santa Nella Station	Out of Study Area
	Oakland Airport (Altamont Pass Alignment)	Out of Study Area
	Restoration of Caltrain service at the Broadway station	Not part of HST Study
Other Peninsula Routes	Variations to the Caltrain ROW	
	Utilize parcel owned by Stanford University to avoid El Palo Alto Park, located 10 meters to the northwest of the existing ROW.	Conceptual Design Issue
	Outside Caltrain ROW	
	Relocate rail alignment to a different area (e.g., via U.S. highway 101 or state highway 280)	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	• Hwy 101	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Utilize Bayshore corridor	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Run tracks over the water from Palo Alto to SFO/Millbrae.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Elevate tracks parallel HWY 101	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Route the HST ROW from SJ to the vicinity of the SF airport through a tube under SF bay	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	• I-280	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Go through El Camino Real for some sections	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Follow alignment east of Coleman Ave west of SJC airport to I-101	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Use Route 87	Studied by San Jose to Merced Team
	Use set of tracks that splits off from the main Caltrain line and goes across the bay as an alternate to the lower peninsula path	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Alignment from Tamien Station that generally follows Highway 87 to the interchange at I-280 where it would thread through flyovers and descend underground to Diridon Station.	Studied by San Jose to Merced Team.
	Utilize BART alignment	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Run HST next to or over major freeways or industrial areas.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Shift alignment east of Menlo Park and Atherton to industrial areas	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	 Relocate southern part of HST tracks (south of San Mateo) to the Baylands corridor, and utilize blimp hanger as train station. 	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Divert tracks away from towns of Menlo Park and Atherton to industrial areas east on the train way to San Jose and Los Angeles.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Eliminate one lane of traffic in each direction on the I-101 and replace with HSR.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	San Jose to Bayshore Freeway to Dumbarton Spur in Menlo Park and rejoin the Caltrain ROW.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	San Jose to Bayshore Freeway to Redwood City and rejoin Caltrain ROW.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	San Jose to Bayshore Freeway to MillIbrae/SFO and rejoin Caltrain ROW.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	 Leave Diridon underground, follow an alignment east of Coleman Avenue and west of SJC airport to HWY 101. 	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Leave Diridon underground and cross under Newhall Yards and then rise to an elevated structure along the western boundary of SJC airport	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	At Moffett Field, join LRT in a trench (or underground or central median) near Ellis Street, then rejoin HWY 101 to the Dumbarton Route or use Veterans Boulevard to enter Redwood City	Included in Alternatives Analysis





	Scoping Comments	Disposition
	Station.	
	End train in Santa Clara	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	No HST on peninsula	Included in Alternatives Analysis (No Project Alternative)
	Avoid Gilroy and go directly to SF	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Track south of San Mateo along Bayland Corridor	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
Non-Peninsula Routes	Altamont Pass	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Route through Altamont Pass to Oakland.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	SJ to Altamont Pass via East Bay spur	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Central Valley to SJ via Altamont Pass with connection to Caltrain and BART	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Go through the East Bay	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Make stop in SJ and continue through East Bay.	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Route through open space in the East Bay.	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	 Connect Oakland Airport with SFO/San Francisco (from Altamont Pass) via eastern rail corridor to Fremont, through Niles Canyon, through the mountains south of Pleasanton and Livermore to connect to Central Valley 	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Evaluate all three East Bay corridors	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Elevate track along Hwy 580	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	 Use old rail route across the southern part of the bay or the east bay rail system that already exists 	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	 Utilize Amtrak ROW to the East Bay, stopping in Oakland and continuing to Sacramento. 	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Use Amtrak through Central Valley instead of Caltrain corridor	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Utilize ACE route to San Jose.	Included in Alternatives Analysis
	Parallel I-5 from Los Angeles to San Francisco.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Parallel I-5 with feeders to bay area cities.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Follow US 99 after I-5 express	Study by others
	 Run up Coast through Santa Barbara and San Luis Obispo, riders could transfer to BART at Oakland to access San Francisco. 	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Alignment alongside I-80 from Bay Area to Sacramento	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Begin route in Stockton or Modesto to the bay area connect just west of Gustine and Los Banos.	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Route through East Bay along HWY 880 from SJ to SF.	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Terminate in San Jose and utilize upgraded Caltrain.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Direct line from Stockton or Modesto to Bay to eliminate travel time from SF to Sac.	Determined in Bay Area to Central Valley Program EIR/EIS
	Go through valley.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
Alternative Technologies	Use Caltrain	
	 Stop at SJ and transfer to Bullet Trains from Caltrain; only stop at Palo Alto or Redwood City, Millbrae to SF 	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Invest more in Baby Bullet upgrades	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Improve Caltrain corridor to permit train speeds up to 160 k/h	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Electrify and upgrade Caltrain	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Other Electrification Options	
	II.S. Donartment	





	Scoping Comments	Disposition
	Evaluate all alternatives to catenary lines, including a third rail	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system)
	Evaluate all feasible train technologies to remove the overhead catenary lines in Belmont (if applicable) and along the Caltrain corridor, including use of a third rail technology	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system)
	 Electrified train operations are generally incompatible with current technology for constant warning time detection systems implemented at grade crossing. Warning devices and train detection equipment would require careful design for safe operation 	Authority has a policy of no at-grade crossings on HST system.
	All electric system	Electric Technology Selected by Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Tunnel HST with hot rail	 Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system) (Tunnel included in Alternatives Analysis)
	Other	
	Build new LRT line or bus way running out of SF on San Jose Avenue and down El Camino Real at street level, with dedicated ROW and traffic signal preference to service short hop commuters. Make Caltrain ROW express only with no more than three stops between SF and SJ, with stops overlapped to allow service to more than three stations. Build people movers where express stations are close to El Camino Real	Not in this Study
	Build second commuter rail line terminating at BART in Daly City and at HSR in SJ and Santa Clara, aligned with HWY 280. Install solar photovoltaic through HST route.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS
	Utilize rubber wheels.	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system)
	Utilize alternative energy sources (wind, solar etc.)	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system)
	1 1/10 mile rail spur for use by Millbrae Train Museum, also to be used for Caltrain and HST for maintenance purposes	Conceptual Design Issue
	Include diesel-powered freight train operations	Conceptual Design Issue
	Evaluate Maglev alternative	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system)
	Evaluate PRT	Determined in Statewide Program EIR/EIS (Technology selected for entire system)
Source: PBS&J, 2009. Disposit	tion by AECOM, 2010.	

